

**PHIL 310: 2014**  
**POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY III**  
**CURRENT ISSUES IN GLOBAL JUSTICE**

In *The Law of Peoples* John Rawls sets out the general principles that should regulate the interactions of all the peoples of the world. He argues that these principles should be acceptable to both liberal and non-liberal societies. We start off by examining whether Rawls' principles are an adequate standard for regulating peoples' behaviour and whether the principles should be acceptable to liberal and non-liberal societies. We then move on to discuss the work of several critics who have in common that they present much bolder accounts of the principles that should define just interaction at the international level.

We consider various issues related to Global Distributive Justice, such as these: What, if anything, are people owed as a matter of justice in the global context? If there are duties of justice, what grounds these? Do we have responsibilities to assist the global poor? Are there global distributive justice duties to assist the global poor? If so, on what basis should distribution proceed? Should we endorse a Global Difference Principle? Are global taxes such as Thomas Pogge's proposed Global Resources Dividend defensible? Is Global Equality of Opportunity an important ideal?

Having dealt with some fundamental theoretical issues, we go on to consider how these might apply to a range of public policy issues such as: Which restrictions on immigration, if any, are justified? Are protectionist policies in trade justified? Can globalization be better harnessed to assist the global poor? How can we better assist those in poor countries who are trying to help themselves?

In the second part of the course we consider issues concerning the basis and limits of sovereignty in some detail, also considering issues related to when (if ever) intervention is justified at the international level. Some questions considered here include: Is military intervention ever justified for humanitarian purposes (such as, in recent years in the cases of Sudan, Libya or Rwanda?) When, if ever, is war permissible? Can preventive or pre-emptive war ever be justified using the just war framework? Issues of global governance and democracy at the global level will also be considered.

**Lecturer:** Professor Gillian Brock

**Lectures:** Thursdays, 10-12 noon.

**Discussion hour:** Mondays 9-10am or Mondays 10-11am. These start in the second week of the semester.

**Assessment:** 60% final 3-hour examination, 40% coursework. Coursework consists of one 3000 word essay. There is no plussage in this course. Essays handed in less than one week later than the due date will be penalized by 5 percent. Essays more than one week late and less than two weeks late are penalized at 10 percent. No essays will be accepted more than two weeks late, unless an extension has been

granted by the lecturer prior to the due date. (Extensions are rare to get, but may be given in exceptional circumstances.) The essay topics follow after this outline of the course and list of important readings.

**Office location:** 322, Arts 2 Building.

E-mail: [g.brock@auckland.ac.nz](mailto:g.brock@auckland.ac.nz) to set up an appointment, if you would like one. Email is the best and quickest way to do this, though you may also like to try my extension: 88739 (university phone number is 373 7599).

**Reference Material:**

Highly recommended:

Gillian Brock *Global Justice: A Cosmopolitan Account* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009).

There are links to electronic copies of resources mentioned in this syllabus (below) in the electronic copy of the syllabus available on CECIL. Additional reading suggestions are also made throughout the course.

Because of copyright restrictions only limited portions of some relevant texts are available on CECIL, notably:

John Rawls [The Law of Peoples](#) (Cambridge, MA: Harvard, 1999).

Rawls's book is available in the short-term loan library, as well as:

Gillian Brock [Global Justice: A Cosmopolitan Account](#) (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009).

**Tutor:**

Chris Siver

Available on: [csiv003@aucklanduni.ac.nz](mailto:csiv003@aucklanduni.ac.nz)

Office hours: TBC

## **Tentative Schedule**

Note that this schedule serves only as a rough guide to approximate course content on a week-by-week basis

The ‘\*’ indicates the most essential reading, perhaps the ones to start with if your time is very limited.

### Introduction for weeks 1-4:

In *The Law of Peoples* John Rawls sets out the general principles that should regulate the interactions of all the peoples of the world. He argues that these principles should be acceptable to both liberal and non-liberal societies. We start off by examining whether Rawls' principles are an adequate standard for regulating peoples' behaviour and whether the principles should be acceptable to liberal and non-liberal societies. We then move on to discuss the work of several critics who have in common that they present much bolder accounts of the principles that should define just interaction at the international level. The main topics covered in these weeks concern Global Distributive Justice and the best framework for thinking about matters of Global Justice.

### Week 1: March 6

Introduction to some of the central issues. Survey of positions and arguments. Introduction to the central debate. Introduction to Rawls' views.

#### Readings:

\* Extracts from John Rawls *The Law of Peoples* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999), pp. 30-43, 48-51, 62-67, 71-72, 75-78. [Available in the knowledge map in CECIL.]

Gillian Brock, *Global Justice*, [Chapter 1](#).

### Week 2: March 13:

Rawls' views continued. Introduction to critics of Rawls' views. Introducing the views of Thomas Pogge.

Themes introduced and discussed:

Global Distributive Justice. Should we endorse a Global Difference Principle?

Should we endorse global taxes such as Thomas Pogge's proposed Global Resource Dividend?

#### Readings:

\* Extracts from John Rawls *The Law of Peoples* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999), pp. 105-120. [Available in the knowledge map in CECIL.]

Charles Beitz *Political Theory and International Relations* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1979), pp. 127-153, and pp. 179-183.

\* Thomas Pogge "[Priorities of Global Justice](#)" *Metaphilosophy* 32 (2001): 6-24.

Week 3: March 20:

Critics of Rawls' continued. Further discussion of Thomas Pogge's views.

Themes discussed:

Global Distributive Justice. Should we endorse a "sufficientarian" account of global distributive justice, such as is endorsed by the capabilities approach?

Readings:

\* Thomas Pogge "[An Egalitarian Law of Peoples](#)" *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 23 (1994): 195-224.

Darrel Moellendorf *Cosmopolitan Justice* (Boulder: Westview Press, 2002),

[Chapter 2](#).

\* Martha Nussbaum [Frontiers of Justice: Disability, Nationality, Species Membership](#) (Cambridge, Mass: Belknap, 2006), pp. 69-95.

Gillian Brock, *Global Justice*, [Chapter 2](#).

Week 4: March 27

Global Equality of Opportunity

Readings:

Bernard Boxill "[Global Equality of Opportunity and National Integrity](#)" *Social Philosophy and Policy* 5 (1987): 143-168.

\* Simon Caney "[Cosmopolitan Justice and Equalizing Opportunities](#)" *Metaphilosophy* 32 (2001): 113-134.

David Miller "[Against Global Egalitarianism](#)" *Journal of Ethics* 9 (2005): 55-79. Reprinted in Gillian Brock and Darrel Moellendorf *Current Debates in Global Justice* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2005).

Gillian Brock "[Egalitarianism, Ideals, and Cosmopolitan Justice](#)" *Philosophical Forum* 36 (2005): 1-30.

Gillian Brock, *Global Justice*, [Chapter 3](#).

Week 5: April 4

Global Equality of Opportunity concluded. Readings as above. In addition there will be a discussion of essays in class, with suggestions and advice offered.

Week 6: April 10

Immigration: What restrictions, if any, are justified in immigration?

Readings:

\* Michael Walzer "The Distribution of Membership" in *Boundaries: National Autonomy and Its Limits*, ed. Peter G. Brown and Henry Shue (Totowa: Rowman and Littlefield, 1981), pp. 1-35.

\* Joseph Carens "[Aliens and Citizens: The Case for Open Borders](#)" *The Review of Politics* 49 (2) (Spring 1987): 251-273.

## MID-SEMESTER BREAK

### Week 7: May 1

Immigration continued. What restrictions, if any, are justified in immigration?

#### Readings:

- \* Mathias Risse "[On the Morality of Immigration](#)" *Ethics and International Affairs* 22 (2008): 25-33.
- Gillian Brock *Global Justice*, [Chapter 8](#).

### Week 8: May 8

Immigration concluded, and introduction of a new set of topics:

What grounds state sovereignty and what are its limits? When is the use of force justified at the global level? An overview of Just War Theory. Intervention for Humanitarian Purposes.

#### Readings:

- \* Background reading - "[Just War Theory](#)" from the *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.
- \* Extracts from the "[Responsibility to Protect Report](#)" compiled by the Committee on Intervention and State Sovereignty.
- Gillian Brock "[Humanitarian Intervention](#)" *Journal of Applied Philosophy* 23 (2006): 277-291 OR *Global Justice*, [Chapter 7](#).

### Week 9: May 15

Justified military intervention continued. Some application of the theory to specific wars, such as, the Second Gulf War. Can preventive or pre-emptive war ever be justified using the just war framework?

#### Readings:

- \* David Mellow "[Iraq: A Morally Justified War](#)" *Journal of Applied Philosophy* 23 (2006): 293-310.
- \* Allen Buchanan and Robert O. Keohane "[The Preventive Use of Force: A Cosmopolitan Institutional Proposal](#)" *Ethics and International Affairs* 18 (2004): 1-22.

### Week 10: May 22

Global governance and global democracy

#### Readings:

- David Held, "[Democracy: From City-States to a Cosmopolitan Order?](#)" *Political Studies* (special issue) 40 (August 1992): 10-39.
- Daniel Weinstock "[The Real World of \(Global\) Democracy](#)" *Journal of Social Philosophy* 37 (2006): 6-20.
- Gillian Brock *Global Justice*, [Chapter 4](#).

Week 11: May 29

Does globalization harm or help the global poor? Can globalization be better harnessed to assist the global poor? How can we better assist those in poor countries who are trying to help themselves?

Readings:

Peter Singer [One World: the ethics of globalization](#) (Yale University Press, 2002), pp. 86-117.

Mathias Risse “[How Does the Global Order Harm the Poor?](#)” *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 33 (Fall, 2005): 349-376.

Gillian Brock Global Justice, [Chapter 5](#) and [Chapter 9](#).

Week 12: June 5

Wrap up and exam preparation.

## ESSAY

### Essay questions

Choose ONE of the following questions:

1. Are Rawls' standards for regulating peoples' behaviour in the international arena compelling? Should they be persuasive to both liberal and non-liberal peoples? Critically discuss with reference to at least one of the following theorists: Darrel Moellendorf, Thomas Pogge, David Reidy, or James Nickel.
2. Should Rawls have included a more substantial list of human rights as part of his Law of Peoples than he apparently does? Critically discuss with reference to at least one of the following theorists: Darrel Moellendorf, Thomas Pogge, David Reidy, or James Nickel.
3. What principle of global distributive justice, if any, would you endorse? Be sure to explain where you stand on at least one of the following issues: (i) whether we should endorse a Global Difference Principle or (ii) whether a "sufficientarian" account is more plausible. Critically discuss with reference to at least one of the following theorists: Thomas Pogge, Charles Beitz, Darrel Moellendorf, Martha Nussbaum, or Gillian Brock.
4. Are any global taxes defensible? Critically discuss with reference to Thomas Pogge's Global Resources Dividend. If you do favour global taxes explain what form they should take and defend your view. If you do not favour global taxes explain why no global taxes can be justified.
5. "Global Equality of Opportunity is an important ideal." Critically discuss this claim with reference to the views of at least one of the following theorists: Simon Caney, Darrel Moellendorf, Bernard Boxill, David Miller, or Gillian Brock.

**Word length:** No more than 3000 words

**Due date:** Monday, May 12<sup>th</sup>.

Help with essay writing will be given during the discussion hours. You are strongly advised to attend all these sessions to reinforce your learning in this course.